1	MARY ANN SMITH	
2	Deputy Commissioner SEAN M. ROONEY	
3	Assistant Chief Counsel MARLOU de LUNA (State Bar No. 162259)	
4	Senior Counsel Department of Business Oversight 320 West 4th Street, Suite 750 Los Angeles, California 90013-2344	
5		
6		
7	Telephone: (213) 576-7606 Facsimile: (213) 576-7181	
8	Attorneys for Complainant	
9	Theories for complainant	
	BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF BUSINESS OVERSIGHT	
10	OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
11		
12	In the Matter of:	FIL ORG ID: 160301
13	THE COMMISSIONER OF BUSINESS	CITATION INCLUDING:
14	OVERSIGHT,	(1) DESIST AND REFRAIN ORDER
15	Complainant,	(2) ASSESSMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE
16	)	PENALTIES
17	V.	(3) CLAIM FOR ANCILLARY RELIEF AND COSTS
18	HANDEL'S ENTERPRISES, INC., LEONARD	
19	J. FISHER,	
20	Respondents.	
21		
22	Jan Lynn Owen, the Commissioner of Business Oversight (Commissioner), finds the	
23	following:	
24	I	
25	<u>Introduction</u>	
26	1. Handel's Enterprises, Inc. (Handel's) is an Ohio corporation with its principal place of	
27	business at 3830 Starr Centre Drive, Suite 1, Canfield, Ohio 44406. Handel's is in the business of	
28		
	-1-	
	CITATION	

operating ice cream shops under the "Handel's" name. The company maintains a website at www.handelsiceream.com.

- 2. At all relevant times, Leonard J. Fisher (Fisher) is the president of Handel's.
- 3. The Commissioner as the chief officer of the Department of Business Oversight (Department) is responsible for administering and enforcing the California Franchise Investment Law (FIL) (Corporations Code § 31000 et seq.).

### II

# **Statement of Facts**

- 4. Since at least December of 2009, Handel's and Fisher (collectively, Respondents) have offered and sold franchises in California pursuant to franchise agreements. The agreements grant the right to engage in the business of operating a retail ice cream store under Handel's trade names, exclusive trademarks, service marks, advertising and other commercial symbols. Handel's Disclosure Document (FDD) states that "[t]he franchisee will operate a business selling homemade ice cream, sherbet, ices, sorbet, frozen yogurt and other ice cream products that principally involves the establishment and operation of an ice cream parlor." Handel's initial registration with the Commissioner to offer and sell franchises in California became effective on December 30, 2009 and expired on April 20, 2010. Handel's is required to renew its registration on an annual basis. Its present franchise registration would terminate on April 22, 2019.
- 5. On March 30, 2015, Handel's filed an application to renew its registration (2015 Registration). The 2015 Registration was approved and became effective on April 13, 2015 and it expired on April 20, 2016.
- 6. On January 11, 2016, Respondents filed a post-effective amendment application to modify its franchise agreement, specifically Article Fourteen, section 14.02; Article Sixteen, section 16.06; and Article Seventeen, sections 17.03, 17.04 and 17.07. The amended franchise agreement became effective on January 19, 2016 (2016 Amended Agreement). There were no revisions made to the FDD.

27 | ///

- 7. On January 22, 2016, Respondents offered and sold at least one Handel's franchise in California (2016 Sale), but Respondents failed to provide the 2016 Amended Agreement (effective on January 19, 2016) to the prospective franchisee who subsequently executed a franchise agreement that did not include the material changes contained in the 2016 Amended Agreement.
- 8. Moreover, in connection with the 2016 Sale, Respondents failed to provide a copy of the FDD, together with a copy of all proposed agreements relating to the sale of the franchise, at least 14 days prior to the execution of the franchise agreement or other agreement, to the prospective franchisee, as required by section 31119.

## Ш

# <u>Citation and Desist and Refrain Order</u> Violations of Corporations Code sections 31119, subdivision (a) and 31201

10. Corporations Code section 31119, subdivision (a), provides:

It is unlawful to sell any franchise in this state that is subject to registration under this law without first providing to the prospective franchisee, at least 14 days prior to the execution by the prospective franchisee of any binding franchise or other agreement, or at least 14 days prior to the receipt of any consideration, whichever occurs first, a copy of the franchise disclosure document, together with a copy of all proposed agreements relating to the sale of the franchise.

11. Corporations Code section 31201 provides:

It is unlawful for any person to offer or sell a franchise in this state by means of any written or oral communication not enumerated in Section 31200 which includes an untrue statement of a material fact or omits to state a material fact necessary in order to make the statements made, in the light of the circumstances under which they were made, not misleading.

- 12. Corporations Code section 31406 provides:
  - (a) If, upon inspection or investigation, based upon a complaint or otherwise, the commissioner has cause to believe that a person is violating any provision of this division or any rule or order promulgated pursuant to this division, the commissioner may issue a citation to that person in writing describing with particularity the basis of the citation. Each citation may contain an order to desist and refrain and an assessment of an administrative penalty not to exceed two

thousand five hundred dollars (\$2,500) per violation and shall contain reference to this section, including the provisions of subdivision (c). All penalties collected under this section shall be deposited in the State Corporations Fund.

- (b) The sanctions authorized under this section shall be separate from, and in addition to, all other administrative, civil, or criminal remedies.
- (c) If within 60 days from the receipt of the citation, the person cited fails to notify the commissioner that the person intends to request a hearing as described in subdivision (d), the citation shall be deemed final.
- (d) Any hearing under this section shall be conducted in accordance with Chapter 5 (commencing with Section 11500) of Part 1 of Division 3 of Title 2 of the Government Code.
- (e) After the exhaustion of the review procedures provided for in this section, the commissioner may apply to the appropriate superior court for a judgment in the amount of the administrative penalty and order compelling the cited person to comply with the order of the commissioner. The application shall include a certified copy of the final order of the commissioner and shall constitute a sufficient showing to warrant the issuance of the judgment and order.
- 13. Based upon the foregoing findings, the Commissioner is of the opinion that Handel's Enterprises, Inc. and Leonard J. Fisher failed to provide a copy of the FDD together with a copy of all proposed agreements relating to the sale of the franchise, at least 14 days prior to the execution of the franchise agreement, to at least one franchisee in this state, in violation of section 31119, subdivision (a). Pursuant to Corporations Code section 31406, Respondents are hereby cited and ordered to desist and refrain from violating Corporations Code section 31119, subdivision (a).
- 14. Further, the Commissioner is of the opinion that Handel's Enterprises, Inc. and Leonard J. Fisher engaged in the offer and sale in this state by means of written or oral communications which include an untrue statement of a material fact or omit to state a material fact necessary in order to make the statements made, in light of the circumstances under which they were made, not misleading, to at least one franchisee, in violation of Corporations Code section 31201. Pursuant to section 31406, Respondents are hereby ordered to desist and refrain from the further offer

or sale of franchises, including but not limited to the operation of ice cream shops under the Handel's name, by means of written or oral communications which include an untrue statement of a material fact or omit to state a material fact necessary in order to make the statements made, in light of the circumstances under which they were made, not misleading.

15. This order is necessary, in the public interest, for the protection of franchisees and consistent with the purposes, policies and provisions of the Franchise Investment Law.

#### IV

# **Administrative Penalties**

- 16. In light of the foregoing findings, under Corporations Code section 31406, Handel's Enterprises, Inc. and Leonard J. Fisher are hereby ordered to pay the Commissioner an administrative penalty in the amount of \$5,000.00 for one violation of each of sections 31119, subdivision (a) and 31201 of the Corporations Code.
- 17. The administrative penalties in the amounts stated above shall be made payable in the form of a cashier's check or Automated Clearing House deposit to the "Department of Business Oversight," and transmitted to the attention of Accounting Enforcement Division, Department of Business Oversight, 1515 K Street, Suite 200, Sacramento, California, 95814. Notice of the payment shall be concurrently sent to Marlou de Luna, Senior Counsel, Department of Business Oversight, 320 West 4th Street, Suite 750, Los Angeles, California 90013, no later than 60 days from the date of this order.

#### $\mathbf{V}$

## **Ancillary Relief and Fees**

- 18. Corporations Code section 31408 provides:
  - (a) If the commissioner determines it is in the public interest, the commissioner may include in any administrative action brought under this division, including a stop order, a claim for ancillary relief, including, but not limited to, a claim for rescission, restitution or disgorgement or damages on behalf of the persons injured by the act or practice constituting the subject matter of the action, and the administrative law judge shall have jurisdiction to award additional

reasonable attorney's fees and investigative expenses for the services rendered, for deposit into the State Corporations Fund for the use of the In light of the foregoing findings, under Corporations Code section 31408, subdivision (b), Handel's Enterprises, Inc. and Leonard J. Fisher shall pay attorney fees and investigative expenses to the Department of Business Oversight in the amount of \$13,200.00 or according to proof. The amount awarded for attorney's fees and investigative expenses shall be made payable in the form of a cashier's check or Automated Clearing House deposit to the "Department of Business Oversight," and transmitted to the attention of Accounting – Enforcement Division, Department of Business Oversight, 1515 K Street, Suite 200, Sacramento, California, 95814. Notice of the payment shall be concurrently sent to Marlou de Luna, Senior Counsel, Department of Business Oversight, 320 West 4th Street, Suite 750, Los Angeles, California 90013, no later than 60 days from the date of This order is necessary, in the public interest, for the protection of investors and franchisees and consistent with the purpose, policies and provisions of the Franchise Investment Law. Commissioner of Business Oversight

relief. The person affected may be required to attend remedial

commissioner is entitled to recover costs, which in the discretion of the

(b) In an administrative action brought under this part the

education, as directed by the commissioner.

1

2

3